

當代美學

第十二講：表現的遺產與過程的觀念（一）

授課教師：國立臺灣大學 哲學系 楊植勝 助理教授




【本著作除另有註明外，採取創用CC「姓名標示—非商業性—相同方式分享」臺灣3.0版授權釋出】

本課程指定教材為：Herwitz, Daniel. *Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy* (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008)

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- (1) Legacies of Expression and (2) Ideas of Process
- 表現的遺產與過程的觀念
- Legacies of (1) Expression and (2) Ideas of Process
- 表現與過程觀念的遺產 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 黑格爾美學後來的發展
 1. “The link between **medium** and **expression** has proved critical for subsequent aesthetics, although it has not always been properly appreciated.”
 2. “Expression has not always been thought of as a social property: the expression of an age.” (p.92) 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


Art as

- Imitation (藝術的模倣理論－西方古代的傳統)
- Form (藝術的形式主義－康德以來的傳統)
- Expression (藝術的表現理論－黑格爾以來的傳統)

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


- 但是黑格爾美學表現的遺產卻被用到個人上：

“As the nineteenth century rode on, art took an expressionist turn; as individual liberty and desire became thematic in societies, the concept of expression became **more personal and individual.**” (p.92) 




Robin George
Collingwood
(1880 - 1943)






The Principles of Art

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


- 柯靈烏的表現理論：
- 藝術是個人的表現（表達），就像語言一樣。
- 作為個人的表現，藝術特別的地方在於，它是感情的表現 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 過程的觀念：

“The fascinating correlate of Collingwood’s idea is that art is **process**, not product. The viewer recapitulates the artist’s act of expression within his or her own imagination, in experiencing the work.” (p.93) 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

“Indeed the true work is this free play of imagination through which the viewer expresses the same **emotion** as the artist. Collingwood is **Kant** turned psychoanalyst.” (p.93) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


- Collingwood與康德的比較

同: “Neither trusts the physical art object as the centre of aesthetic experience, but rather the free play of imagination that takes place around it.”

異: “For both the real aesthetic experience is an act taking place within the twinned souls of artist and audience, rather than on the page of the book, or in the frame of the painting.” (p.93) 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- Collingwood與康德的比較

異: “For Kant the physical object is simply an **occasion**; for Collingwood a kind of **road map**, directing the viewer to the same (or similar) experience as the artist had while making it.”
(p.93) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

“The view turns art into an active gesture, emphasizing ‘work’ above all else.” (p.93)


- Art is a kind of **labour**, a labour of the imagination with materials and forms, a gesture of investing them with traces of one’s own spirit, and forcing them into patterns of conclusion.” → 創作
- And for the modern audience to grasp the work is for that audience to submit to a similar labour, call it a labour of **work** or of **love**, depending.” → 欣賞 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 藝術的創作：

“To express an emotion in a work of art is for Collingwood **to work it through.**” (p.93)


“ If Aristotle thought tragic drama an act of purgation, Collingwood thinks all art a **purgation** through which fire is transmuted to gold and in the wake of which we can live without insuperable burden.”

(pp.93-94) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


- 藝術的欣賞：

“A work of art lives in history **through each person's history of its remaking**. And so re-enactment allows for knowledge of self and other, the sharing of feelings in every case worked through.”

“The audience is transformed into **active artists** working through their own similar emotion.” (p.94) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- Collingwood的歷史觀

“Collingwood’s vision of history is similarly that of re-enactment. To know the mediaeval age is to know its mind, and that is to re-enact its course of actions, from motivation to intention to effect. To know another soul is to make art of their art, thus sharing their spirit.” (p.94) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 對Collingwood美學的批評
 1. 對過程觀念的批評
- “To know an emotion in art is not necessarily to feel it.” 這其實是要說：欣賞的過程不等於創作的過程
- 以Johannes Brahms的音樂作品為例
- 以August Strindberg的戲劇作品為例


Herwitz的看法：“Rather than thinking art causes an act of self-expression on my part, it is plausible that it excited my imagination.”

(p.94) 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

2. 對表現本身的批評

“Nor is it always true that an artist uses a work as a vehicle for **self-expression**, even if this is a central concern of at least one region of modernism, that of Proust, abstract expressionism, modern theatre, certain strands of poetry.” (p.94)

- 對於個別的藝術家而言，表現並非全部；雖然在某些藝術家、某些流派或某些藝術領域那裡表現的確是最重要的 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念


- 第2個批評援引|Peter Kivy論義大利歌劇的誕生所提出的論點：
“... the birth of Italian opera took place under a speech theory of music, according to which the goal of composition was **to invent the craft of transposing human speech made under the influence of emotion into the musical aria and accompaniment**. The goal, similar to the literary invention of characters, was not self-expression but **control over material**. It was about learning how to make music *seem* expressive, how to make the aria seem as if the singer were overcome with emotion.” (pp.94-95) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 第2個批評也再引|Brahms的音樂作品為例 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

藝術的三個理論：

- Theory of imitation
- Theory of form
- Theory of expression 


第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- Herwitz認為，一方面，就個人的表現而言，終究要回到康德所謂的愉悅，亦即認知能力的自由遊玩。換言之，表現是為了愉悅：

“... expression in art is also about the Kantian **pleasure** we take in our own capacities for free play of imagination and free creation. This **cheerfulness** suffuses...” (p.95) 

第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- 藝術上的表現不同於一般的表現；一般的表現就是把感情直接表現出來，藝術的表現則是把感情間接地用媒介有技巧表現出來，因而是反思的

Expression is a **reflective** act, not simply a **direct** working through of suffering or sadness. It is an act that takes shape through the making, and celebrates its own talent and absorption in the medium.” (p.95) 





第四節 表現的遺產與過程的觀念

- Herwitz認為，在另一方面，柯靈烏的表現也完全忽略了黑格爾的媒介理論：

“Collingwood’s theory ironically deletes what Hegel had already foregrounded: that every thing happening in art happens because it happens **in a particular medium**” (p.95)

- 不過這只能就社會的表現而言；在個人的表現方面，很難兼顧到媒介 


版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
1-33			轉載自Microsoft Office 2007 PowerPoint設計主題範本，本作品依據Microsoft服務合約及著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
2	(1) Legacies of Expression and (2) Ideas of Process 表現的遺產與過程的觀念 Legacies of (1) Expression and (2) Ideas of Process 表現與過程觀念的遺產		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.92 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
3	黑格爾美學後來的發展 1. “The link between medium and expression has proved critical for subsequent aesthetics, although it has not always been properly appreciated.” 2. “Expression has not always been thought of as a social property: the expression of an age.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.6,92 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
5	<p>但是黑格爾美學表現的遺產卻被用到個人上：</p> <p>“As the nineteenth century rode on, art took an expressionist turn; as individual liberty and desire became thematic in societies, the concept of expression became more personal and individual.”</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.92 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>
6			<p>WIKIMEDIA COMMONS / 作者：Thoemmes Continuum http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Robin_G_Collingwood.jpg 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>
8	<p>柯靈烏的表現理論： 藝術是個人的表現（表達），就像語言一樣。 作為個人的表現，藝術特別的地方在於，它是感情的表現</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.92,93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
9	過程的觀念： “The fascinating correlate of Collingwood’s idea is that art is process, not product. The viewer recapitulates the artist’s act of expression within his or her own imagination, in experiencing the work.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
10	“Indeed the true work is this free play of imagination through which the viewer expresses the same emotion as the artist. Collingwood is Kant turned psychoanalyst.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
11	Collingwood與康德的比較 同：“Neither trusts the physical art object as the centre of aesthetic experience, but rather the free play of imagination that takes place around it.” 異：“For both the real aesthetic experience is an act taking place within the twinned souls of artist and audience, rather than on the page of the book, or in the frame of the painting.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。



版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
12	Collingwood與康德的比較 異：“For Kant the physical object is simply an occasion; for Collingwood a kind of road map, directing the viewer to the same (or similar) experience as the artist had while making it.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
13	“The view turns art into an active gesture, emphasizing ‘work’ above all else.” Art is a kind of labour, a labour of the imagination with materials and forms, a gesture of investing them with traces of one’s own spirit, and forcing them into patterns of conclusion.” → 創作 And for the modern audience to grasp the work is for that audience to submit to a similar labour, call it a labour of work or of love, depending.” → 欣賞		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.93 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
14	<p>藝術的創作：</p> <p>“To express an emotion in a work of art is for Collingwood to work it through.”</p> <p>“ If Aristotle thought tragic drama an act of purgation, Collingwood thinks all art a purgation through which fire is transmuted to gold and in the wake of which we can live without insuperable burden.”</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.93,94 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>
15	<p>藝術的欣賞：</p> <p>“A work of art lives in history through each person’ s history of its remaking. And so re-enactment allows for knowledge of self and other, the sharing of feelings in every case worked through.”</p> <p>“The audience is transformed into active artists working through their own similar emotion.”</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.94 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>


版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
16	Collingwood的歷史觀 “Collingwood’ s vision of history is similarly that of re-enactment. To know the mediaeval age is to know its mind, and that is to re-enact its course of actions, from motivation to intention to effect. To know another soul is to make art of their art, thus sharing their spirit.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.94 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
17	對Collingwood美學的批評 1.對過程觀念的批評 “To know an emotion in art is not necessarily to feel it.” 這其實是要說：欣賞的過程不等於創作的過程 以Johannes Brahms的音樂作品為例 以August Strindberg的戲劇作品為例 Herwitz的看法：“Rather than thinking art causes an act of self-expression on my part, it is plausible that it excited my imagination.”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.94 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
18	<p>2.對表現本身的批評</p> <p>“Nor is it always true that an artist uses a work as a vehicle for self-expression, even if this is a central concern of at least one region of modernism, that of Proust, abstract expressionism, modern theatre, certain strands of poetry.”</p> <p>對於個別的藝術家而言，表現並非全部；雖然在某些藝術家、某些流派或某些藝術領域那裡表現的確是最重要的</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.94</p> <p>本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>
19	<p>第2個批評援引Peter Kivy論義大利歌劇的誕生所提出的論點：</p> <p>“... the birth of Italian opera took place under a speech theory of music, according to which the goal of composition was to invent the craft of transposing human speech made under the influence of emotion into the musical aria and accompaniment. The goal, similar to the literary invention of characters, was not self-expression but control over material. It was about learning how to make music <i>seem</i> expressive, how to make the aria seem as if the singer were overcome with emotion.”</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.94,95</p> <p>本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
20	第2個批評也再引Brahms的音樂作品為例		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.95 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
21	藝術的三個理論： Theory of imitation Theory of form Theory of expression		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.95 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。
22	Herwitz認為，一方面，就個人的表現而言，終究要回到康德所謂的愉悅，亦即認知能力的自由遊玩。換言之，表現是為了愉悅： “... expression in art is also about the Kantian pleasure we take in our own capacities for free play of imagination and free creation. This cheerfulness suffuses...”		<i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i> , Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008), p.95 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。

版權聲明

頁碼	作品	版權標示	作者／來源
23	<p>藝術上的表現不同於一般的表現；一般的表現就是把感情直接表現出來，藝術的表現則是把感情間接地用媒介有技巧表現出來，因而是反思的</p> <p>Expression is a reflective act, not simply a direct working through of suffering or sadness. It is an act that takes shape through the making, and celebrates its own talent and absorption in the medium.”</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.95 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>
24	<p>Herwitz認為，在另一方面，柯靈烏的表現也完全忽略了黑格爾的媒介理論：</p> <p>“Collingwood’ s theory ironically deletes what Hegel had already foregrounded: that every thing happening in art happens because it happens in a particular medium”</p> <p>不過這只能就社會的表現而言；在個人的表現方面，很難兼顧到媒介</p>		<p><i>Aesthetics: Key Concepts in Philosophy</i>, Herwitz, Daniel. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2008) , p.95 本作品依據著作權法第46、52、65條合理使用。</p>